

THE IMPLICATION OF COOPERATIVE INTEGRATED READING AND COMPOSITION (CIRC) TECHNIQUE ON ENGLISH READING COMPREHENSION FOR MADRASAH ALIYAH STUDENTS

M. Arif Rahman Hakim¹

UIN Fatmawati Sukarno Bengkulu

Pengky Kemadi Amrulin²

UIN Fatmawati Sukarno Bengkulu

Fera Zasrianita³

UIN Fatmawati Sukarno Bengkulu

Yuda Septian Kurniawan⁴

STIESNU Bengkulu

arifelsiradj@mail.uinfabengkulu.ac.id¹

Submit, 21-03-2023

Accepted, 21-06-2023

Publish, 22-06-2023

ABSTRACT

The objective of this study was to find out whether or not there was an effect of the Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) Technique on Students' Reading Comprehension in understanding the Narrative text at MA Pancasila Bengkulu City. In this study, the researcher used a Quasi-Experimental research, nonequivalent pretest-posttest control group. The population of this research was the tenth-grade students at MA Panacasila Bengkulu. The sample was X MIPA.1, which was treated as an experimental class and taught by using CIRC Technique, and X MIPA.2 was treated as a control class and taught by using a conventional strategy. There were 30 students who were sampled as 19 experimental classes and 19 control classes. To determine the sample, the researcher used the Total sampling technique. In the process of data collection, the researcher used tests and documentation as research instruments. The test takes the form of multiple choice containing 20 questions. The test is given to both experimental and control classes as pre-test and post-test. The data from the pre-test and post-test were examined using the t-test. The result of this research showed that the student's reading comprehension test for the experimental class mean score was 54.21, while the control class was 44.47, and post-test findings revealed that the experimental class had an average value of 80.79, while the control class had an average value of 71.58. The hypothesis test results show that the output of the independent sample t-test (sig. 2-tailed) is 0.001, which is lower than 0.05. So, H_0 was rejected, and H_a was accepted. In brief, it can be concluded that Cooperative

Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) Technique can be one of the effective ways of teaching reading to tenth-grade students at the *Madrasah Aliyah* level.

Keywords: *Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC), Madrasah Aliyah, Narrative Text Reading Comprehension*

INTRODUCTION

In learning English, students should be proficient in all four language skills: listening, speaking, reading, and writing. It is built on the goal of teaching English. One of the abilities required to effectively use English is reading. Reading in English is becoming more crucial for worldwide communication. Reading is a receptive skill (Kotaman, 2020) because it involves the process through which readers derive meaning from the text they are reading. Interpreting and extrapolating meaning from the written word is part of the set of skills that make up reading (Dobson & Ziemann, 2020). An essential skill for learning the English language is reading. Reading is one of the many reasons why it is so vital, and in the beginning, it might help the students increase their knowledge. Reading is all about comprehension (Smith et al., 2021). Then, reading can assist students in developing other language abilities, including speaking, listening, and writing.

Reading means comprehending every aspect of the text in addition to just looking at and pronouncing words, and beneficial for learning a language (Muslaini, 2017; Peters & Webb, 2018). Students read more but are less aware of what they are reading as they do so; as a result, they comprehend more as they read. As a result, readers needed to comprehend what they were reading. Their reading efforts are meaningless if they do not understand what they read. So, especially in reading class, the instructor needs to be able to establish a welcoming and engaging learning environment, considering that the student has to comprehend the English text. A significant part of schooling is reading because reading is the process of decoding and comprehending material for a specified reading purpose (Anderson, 2018). The goal of reading instruction should be to improve students' comprehension. In order to make a text relevant, readers must take active steps. In order to help the students learn the subject more easily, it is necessary to have knowledge of the existing material and proper teaching methods. Furthermore, reading is a crucial component of schooling. Our educational system not only requires extensive reading as a part of the learning process, but it also frequently uses fluency in reading as a sign of broader intellectual prowess. The most important and first reading is reading about *Allah Subhanahu Wa-ta'ala*, as contained in *surah Al 'alaq* verses 1-5 (Al-Ghiffary, 2022). The command to read in *Surah Al 'Alaq* involves a high mental process, namely the process of recognition, recall, observation, and creativity. Related to that, as Muslims, it is very important for us to learn some foreign languages (Hakim, 2017).

Understanding the lexical meaning of each word in a passage is simply one aspect of reading comprehension; it is equally important to understand what ideas or information are being introduced clearly in each passage. Learning to read requires preparation since it requires the learner to understand how to arrange and evaluate what they have read as well as how to notice differences in word length and word shape. With proper methodology, it will be possible to inspire and encourage pupils to comprehend a text during in-class reading activities. One method of cooperative learning is cooperative, integrated reading and writing. Cooperative integrated reading and composition (CIRC) is a method that relies on collaboration. It attempts to hone students' writing, reading, spelling, and vocabulary abilities. CIRC is a learning strategy that can aid students in developing their skills and capacities (Dwijani, 2019), can aid students in developing their skills and capacities. Because of the learning strategies used, it is possible to indicate how the material presented has been developed, thought through, and evaluated. To develop reading skills, educators must innovate and be creative in using learning approaches so that reading skills learning activities take place optimally; one of the approaches commonly used by educators is the Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) learning Technique approach. The CIRC Learning Technique is a learning model that is quite simple, easy, and practical to train students' reading comprehension skills.

The researchers are interested in conducting a study related to Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) on the reading comprehension of English students at one of the Madrasah Aliyah in Bengkulu, Indonesia, in connection with several phenomena. When the researchers held pre-observations at MA Pancasila Kota Bengkulu which means that the researchers got preliminary data, such as data collected by teachers, that students are required to study reading comprehension with some identified problems, the most common reading difficulties faced by students. The first problem is unfamiliar texts; they are unable to comprehend them because they have no idea what is the topic of the text. According to Lai et al. (2019), background knowledge is used by students to incorporate information from a text into their prior knowledge. Furthermore, cultural differences have an impact on reading comprehension. Reading difficulties are caused by students' lack of understanding of the other culture, an unfamiliar cultural context, cultural content knowledge, and vocabulary knowledge. The last problem is students think learning English is difficult. Therefore, students do not have an interest in learning English further. They think learning English is boring with teacher-centered learning methods and also not varied. This almost certainly results in issues understanding the reading content, which may be due to a delay in mastering other basic English skills. Therefore this research needs to be conducted

in order to see the implications of CIRC on the reading skills of students in the tenth grade of Madrasah Aliyah.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Reading is one of the four language skills that are crucial for students to develop. Key elements of the reading skill set include making sense of and interpreting the meaning of printed words. Reading and academic achievement are closely related. One who performs well in school tends to enjoy reading. Reading is one of the English language skills that play a significant role in helping students acquire a foreign language, according to (Afriani et al., 2020). As a result, reading abilities should be developed as soon as is practical. Students are actively accountable for figuring out and comprehending the texts' themes while they read. Reading is a form of written language interaction that uses texts as its medium (Ismail et al., 2017). To increase their understanding, students must read a range of materials during the reading activity. It is not always easy to find information in the writings. A skilled reader should be able to integrate new information into what they already know. According to Febriani & Jono (2021), any reading that you find confusing feels like a waste of time. Reading, according to Hedgcock (2018), is the advanced readers' ability to comprehend textual information and rapidly construct meaning by combining it with their own prior knowledge. One genre in the reading text is a narrative text, a text that includes legends, short stories, and other stories from the past that are told to entertain the reader is called a narrative text. The past tense is used to convey narrative prose. If the reader chooses to read the narrative text, which is its intended purpose, they will be entertained by the story. Use the past tense to keep the reader engaged throughout the story. The narrative is based on a true incident or an imagined tale with a straightforward topic that is resolved in the conclusion. A narrative text, according to Wallner (2019), is one that recounts the events that lead up to or are brought about by a series of logically and chronologically related variables. He also asserts that comprehension of a narrative's storyline, subject, characters, events, and relationships among them is crucial.

Moreover, Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) is a comprehensive reading, writing, and language arts curriculum (Kamdideh et al., 2019). Direct instruction in reading comprehension, input into writing activities, and any other relevant abilities suggested by the approach are included in the preceding description of CIRC. That technique related to the cooperative learning strategy was found to be a successful method for increasing reading comprehension levels (Yusuf et al., 2019), who examined the relative efficacy of small-group interaction strategies. Students in cooperative learning must collaborate to complete a task they could not complete on their own. Cooperative learning is an organized method that involves several steps that combines a variety of learning activities to improve students' grasp of a subject. Language is viewed as a means of forming social connections in cooperative learning. Students are given the chance to use language to negotiate meaning in a real-world setting. Cooperative learning enhances and facilitates learning. The outcomes include improved long-

term memory precision, the development of critical thinking, and higher comprehension and reasoning levels. Cooperative learning has numerous benefits for learners of second languages, so language classes benefit from intelligible, developmentally appropriate, redundant, and somewhat redundant small group work (Darmawansah, 2022).

RESEARCH METHOD

This study was done to determine how well the students of *Madrasah Aliyah Pancasila* Bengkulu are in reading comprehension. This research study used a quantitative-experimental technique in collecting the data. The purpose of this research was in order to examine a particular population or sample, collect data, use research instruments, and analyze quantitative or statistical data with the aim of testing a hypothesis, and therefore quantitative research methods are said to be research methods that are based on the positivist philosophy. Experimental research is a sort of quantitative study in which the researcher manipulates one or more independent variables while also accounting for other pertinent variables and gauging the effect of the manipulation on the dependent variable. An experimental study aims to demonstrate the relationship between two or more variables. This study's population includes all tenth-grade classes of *Madrasah Aliyah Pancasila* Bengkulu students in Bengkulu City, where there are 38 students in class X, which is split into two classes, as can be seen in the table below.

Table 1. The population of the research

No	Class	Students		Number of Students	Average value
		Male	Female		
1	X MIPA 1	11	8	19	76,5
2	X MIPA 2	8	11	19	75,5
Total				38	

In *Madrasah Aliyah Pancasila* Bengkulu city, especially in tenth-grade class, there is only a Science or MIPA class which consists of 2 classes, namely tenth MIPA 1 and MIPA 2. Where the researchers used the tenth MIPA 2 class as the experimental group and the tenth MIPA 1 class as the control group. The reason that made researchers choose class tenth MIPA 1 as the control group was that that class had a higher average score in English subject rather than the average score of tenth MIPA 2.

Table 2. The Sample of the Research

Class	Students		Total	Average Value
	Male	Female		
Control (X Mipa 1)	11	8	19	76,5
Experiment (X Mipa 2)	8	11	19	75,5

Related to the instruments for this research are consist to the test which

every teaching and learning experience should include a test. The purpose of this set of questions is to assess a student's talent, intelligence, and skill. According to the syllabus's standard competencies, the test was a reading comprehension test that took the shape of a narrative text. Only tests (Pre-test and Post-test) have used by the researcher in this study to gather the data. The researcher evaluated students' reading comprehension of narrative texts using a test with multiple-choice test with 20 questions. Each question has a percentage of 5, and if the learner is able to correctly answer every question, the final score is 100. The following elements are typically used to gauge students' reading comprehension for each item question based on Brown: core concept (subject), expression/idiom/contextual detail, inference (implied detail), grammatical traits, detail (searching for an explicitly stated detail), eliminating unwritten facts, supporting the idea, and context-sensitive vocabulary. The procedure for collecting data for the experimental group is below:

Table 3. Stage of Research Collection Data for Experimental Group

Pre-Test	Treatment	Post-Test
Based on their results, the pre-test served as a gauge of the student's comprehension. The pre-test contained a total of 20 items. It is a test of reading comprehension.	The four meetings of the CIRC Model's treatment for the experimental group were based on the lesson plan.	After the treatment, a post-test was administered and analyzed as the final data of the study. A total of 20 were used in the protest.

The Technique of Data Analysis

The test is given to students after they have completed the treatment. The objective of this test is to validate the effectiveness of CIRC. The normality and homogeneity tests from SPSS version 24 were used to first evaluate the test results. The data were analyzed by putting hypotheses and assumptions to the test. Homogeneity tests and normality tests are two types of assumption testing. This is taken into account when deciding whether to proceed with parametric or nonparametric tests as the following step in data analysis,

FINDING

Normality Test

The normality test is conducted to see whether the data are normally distributed before analysis; if the probability is greater than 0,05, the data may be distributed. Because there are fewer than 50 data points in the sample, the Kolmogorov-Smirnov test is performed to analyze normality. The first result is about the normality test on the Pre-test and post-test in the control and experiment class. Students from the control and experiment classes' pre- and post-test normality test results are displayed in Table 4 below:

Table 4. Normality test result
One-Sample Kolmogorov-Smirnov Test

	Students' Reading Comprehension (Control-Pretest)	Students' Reading Comprehension (Control-Posttest)	Students' Reading Comprehension (Experiment-Pre-test)	Students' Reading Comprehension (Experiment-Posttest)
N	19	19	19	19
Normal Parameters ^{a,b}	Mean	44.47	71.58	54.21
	Std. Deviation	25.975	7.827	11.336
Most Extreme Differences	Absolute	.185	.173	.159
	Positive	.185	.173	.082
	Negative	-.154	-.104	-.159
Test Statistic	.185	.173	.159	
Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed)	.086 ^c	.136 ^c	.200 ^{c,d}	

- a. Test distribution is Normal.
- b. Calculated from data.
- c. Lilliefors Significance Correction.
- d. This is a lower bound of the true significance.

The Student Reading Comprehension (Control-Pretest), Student Reading Comprehension (Control-Posttest), Student Reading Comprehension (Experiment-Pretest), and Student Reading Comprehension (Experiment-Posttest) tests' Kolmogorov-Smirnov test results are displayed in the table above. The table shows that the p-value (Sig.) for students' reading comprehension on the Control-Pretest is 0.086. The p-value (Sig.) for students' reading comprehension on the Control-Posttest is 0.136. for the Experiment- Pre-test reading comprehension of students was 0.200, and the p-value (Sig.) on the Experiment-Posttest, students' reading comprehension was 0.085. (Sig.) Because all of the values for the control-pretest, control-posttest, experiment-pretest, and experiment-posttest reading comprehension tests had p values greater than 0.05, the data for these tests are considered to have a normal distribution.

Homogeneity test

The homogeneity test looks at how similar the experimental class and the control class are. The Levene test was employed, and the results are shown in the following table:

Table 4.2. Test of Homogeneity of Variances

		Levene Statistic	df1	df2	Sig.
Students Reading Comprehensiv	Based on Mean	.210	1	36	.649
	Based on Median	.246	1	36	.623

e on	Based on the Median and with adjusted df	.246	1	34.804	.623
	Based on trimmed mean	.222	1	36	.640

The homogeneity test's results, which had a p-value of 0.649, are presented in the table that can be found above using the Levene Test for Student Reading Comprehension (Experiment) and Student Reading Comprehension (Control) data. Since the p-value was greater than 0.05, the data for Students' Reading Comprehension (Experiment) and Students' Reading Comprehension (Control) are regarded as identical or homogeneous.

Using a sample T-test in pairs, the researcher compared the mean scores of the pre-test and post-test students in each class. In order to compare or do research on the average values of two linked groups, the result of the sample T-test in the control Class is presented in Table 5 below:

Table 5. Control Class Paired Samples Statistics

		Mean	N	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Pair 1	Students' Reading Comprehension (Control-Posttest)	71.58	19	7.827	1.796
	Students' Reading Comprehension (Control-Pretest)	44.47	19	25.975	5.959

The average (Mean) as well as the standard deviation (Std. Deviation) values for the Control-Posttest and Control-Pretest reading comprehension scores of students. Reading comprehension on the Control-Posttest was assessed with an average score of 71.58 and a standard deviation of 7.827, in contrast to the student's reading comprehension on the Control-Pretest, which had an average score of 44.47 and a standard deviation of 25.975. Thus, it was possible to draw the conclusion that all of the data had significant mean scores that were higher after the test than they were before the test. On the other hand, the result of the T-test in the experiment class is presented in Table 6 below:

Table 6. Experiment Class Paired Samples Statistics

		Mean	N	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Pair 1	Students' Reading Comprehension (Experiment- Post-test)	80.79	19	8.039	1.844
	Students' Reading Comprehension (Experiment-Pretest)	54.21	19	11.336	2.601

The values for Students' Reading Comprehension (Experiment- Post-test) and Students' Reading Comprehension's mean (Experiment-Pretest) and standard deviation are displayed in the table above. Students' reading comprehension scores on the experiment's post-test averaged 80.79, with a standard deviation of 8.039, while their scores on the experiment's pre-test averaged 54.21, with a standard deviation of 11.336, as shown in the table. Thus, it was possible to draw the conclusion that all of the data had significant mean scores that were higher than the pre-test.

DISCUSSION

Determining the impact of the Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) Technique on students' reading comprehension is the main purpose of this study. The study involved MA Pancasila Kota Bengkulu students in the tenth grade. According to the study's findings, there were 19 students enrolled in the tenth grade. Nineteen samples from the MA Pancasila Kota Bengkulu students in the tenth grade were used in this study as an experimental group class. The Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) Technique was used to deliver the treatment in the experimental group class. After receiving the treatment, the students were given a post-test to gauge their final abilities. A pre-test in the control class while being given the teacher's standard approach is followed by a post-test to determine the student's proficiency.

A normality test should be run on the data before analysis to ascertain whether or not they are normally distributed. If the probability is larger than 0.05, the data may be regularly distributed. On the basis of the aforementioned Kolmogorov-Smirnov test, it was determined that the experimental and control pre-test and post-test classes both had significant probability (sig) $p > 0,05$. This indicates that the results from the pre-test for both the control group and the experiment were regularly distributed.

The findings from the control group's pre- and post-tests before and after using the usual technique were presented. Pre-test results for the control group showed an average (Mean) score of 44.47 for reading comprehension, while post-test results revealed an average (Mean) score of 71.58 for reading comprehension. Based on the findings from the experiment group's pre-and post-tests, cooperative, integrated reading, and composition (CIRC) were administered. In the Experiment group's pre-test, students' reading comprehension resulted in an average score (Mean) of 54.21; however, the post-test revealed that this average score (Mean) had increased to 80.79. There is a difference in the average student learning outcomes in the Experiment class and the Control class due to differences in treatment during the learning carried out. The learning process of students in the control class used learning with conventional techniques where students are given material with skimming and scanning techniques (Conventional). Meanwhile, the student's learning process in the experimental class used Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC), where this technique can motivate students to be enthusiastic about learning and easily understand learning materials about Reading Comprehension because the CIRC technique is studied in groups and for groups that have studied the work of a good group are given rewards (Jahanbakshsh,

2019). Thus it provoked a reaction from the other groups to try to get a similar award so that there was a new motivation for learning activities.

The Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique has a considerable impact on reading ability, according to the independent sample test in the table above. It can be claimed that the experimental class and the control class have nearly equal levels of learning ability because the average pre-test score for the experimental class was 54.21, and the average score for the control class was 44.47. However, the control class was obtained with an average value of 44.47 to 71.58 following treatment for each class. At the same time, the experimental group recorded average results between 54.21 and 80.79. So it can be concluded that the researchers' hypothesis H₀ is rejected and H_a is accepted; this means that there is a significant effect of the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition (CIRC) technique on students' reading comprehension in the tenth grade of *Madrasah Aliyah Pancasila* Bengkulu city. The result of this study is in line with research conducted by Telaumbanua (2020), which his research found that students' writing learning results can be improved by using the Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) learning model. Therefore it can be assumed that using Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique was one of the good techniques in motivating students to learn English, especially in writing. Another study conducted by Supriyadi (2018) about students' speaking learning results can be improved by using the Cooperative Integrated Reading And Composition (CIRC) learning model. The experimental group class received treatment using the CIRC technique. The students were given a post-test following the treatment to evaluate their final aptitudes. The students take a pre-test in the control group while receiving the teacher's usual instruction, then a post-test to gauge their level of competency. The CIRC model was then found to have a significant impact on students in learning writing. Because by using this method, students were able to collaborate with their friends in a group. By participating in this exercise, the students had fun while the learning process and more participated in the lesson.

The researchers also assume that the use of Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) can also improve students speaking skills, helping students to concentrate on learning to speak (Napaporn et al., 2023). The use of media images also helps students to be enthusiastic and compose sentences to prepare to speak and reduce their panic feeling. So from the explanation that was presented before, the researchers are sure that the use of the Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) method could improve Reading comprehension, Speaking skills, and also improve writing ability.

CONCLUSION

Related to the researchers' hypothesis in this study, it is concluded that H₀ is rejected and H₁ is accepted; this means that there is a significant effect of the Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique on students' reading comprehension in the tenth-grade of *Madrasah Aliyah Pancasila* Bengkulu city. This is proven by the result of pre-test, post-test, and T-test data analysis that

has been done by researchers in this study. From the explanation above and based on the research that has been done that with the use of Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) Technique, students experience an increase in reading comprehension learning scores and become better than the control class after the CIRC method treatment. Based on the research observation that researchers did in the class during the treatment process in the experimental group, the students felt happier in learning, just like studying in groups and not boring. They also become more enthusiastic about learning because students can discuss directly with their friends so that students did easily help each other in understanding the subjects given.

After all, researchers made some of the following recommendations in light of the findings of the aforementioned research, discussion, and conclusions. Suggestions for Students, Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique is advised for students to be able to practice since it can encourage students to be excited about studying and readily comprehend learning materials about reading comprehension. While for the suggestion to the teachers, because this teaching method can improve students' reading comprehension, it is advised that teachers adopt the cooperative, integrated reading and composition (CIRC) technique in teaching the learning process. For further researchers, it is hoped that this research will improve future researchers' understanding of educational research, particularly that which aims to improve reading comprehension using the learning model. It may, however, serve as a different source in the future to help researchers obtain more reliable findings.

REFERENCES

- Afriani, Z. L., Anggraini, M., & Riswanto, R. (2020). The Effect of Question Answer Relationship (QAR) Strategy in Enhancing Students' Reading Comprehension. *Journal of English Education and Teaching*, 4(4), 548–558. <https://doi.org/10.33369/jeet.4.4.548-558>
- Al-Ghiffary, G. M. S. (2022). The Concept Of Reading According To The Qur'an Perspective. *International Journal of Cultural and Social Science*, 3(2), 224-233. <https://pcijournal.org/index.php/ijcss/article/view/533>
- Anderson, R. C. (2018). Role of the reader's schema in comprehension, learning, and memory. In *Theoretical models and processes of literacy* (pp. 136-145). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315110592>
- Darmawansah, D., Lin, C. J., & Hwang, G. J. (2022). Empowering the collective reflection-based argumentation mapping strategy to enhance students' argumentative speaking. *Computers & Education*, 184, 104516. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2022.104516>
- Dobson, M., & Ziemann, B. (Eds.). (2020). *Reading primary sources: The interpretation of texts from nineteenth and twentieth-century history*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429401916>
- Dwijayani, N. M. (2019, October). Development of circle learning media to improve student learning outcomes. In *Journal of Physics: Conference*

Series (Vol. 1321, No. 2, p. 022099). IOP Publishing. 10.1088/1742-6596/1321/2/022099

- Fatkul, M., & Astiyandha, T. (2021). Exploring The Students' Reading Strategies in Tenth Grade of Senior High School. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa*, 17(1), 87–99. <https://doi.org/10.34005/lingua.v17i1.1369>
- Febriani H, & Jono A.A. (2021). Improving Students Reading Comprehension of Procedural Text Using KWL Strategy. *Al-Lughah Jurnal Bahasa*, 10(1), 95. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.29300/lughah.v10i1.4555>
- Hakim, M. A. R. (2017). Teachers' strategies in teaching Speaking lessons Introvert students in Madrasah Aliyah (MA) Ja-alHaq Bengkulu. *MADANIA*, 21, 23–30. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.29300/madania.v21i1.229>
- Hedgcock, J. S., & Ferris, D. R. (2018). *Teaching readers of English: Students, texts, and contexts*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315465579>
- Jahanbakhsh, A. A., Ali Asgari Zamani, M., & Garman, Z. (2019). CIRC and STAD in Iranian context: Through the five elements to cooperative learning of lexical collocations. *Cogent Arts & Humanities*, 6(1), 1692469. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311983.2019.1692469>
- Kamdideh, Z., Vaseghi, R., & Talatifard, S. (2019). The effects of reciprocal teaching of reading and cooperative integrated reading and composition on the reading comprehension of Iranian EFL intermediate students. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 9(9), 1111-1117. <http://dx.doi.org/10.17507/tpls.0909.06>
- Kotaman, H. (2020). Impacts of dialogical storybook reading on young children's reading attitudes and vocabulary development. *Reading Improvement*, 57(1), 40–45. <https://www.ingentaconnect.com/contentone/prin/rimp/2020/00000057/0000001/art00005>
- Lai, A. F., Chen, C. H., & Lee, G. Y. (2019). An augmented reality-based learning approach to enhancing students' science reading performances from the perspective of the cognitive load theory. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, 50(1), 232–247. <https://doi.org/10.1111/bjet.12716>
- Muslaini. (2017). Strategies For Teaching Reading Comprehension. *English Education Journal*, 8(1), 66–77. <https://jurnal.usk.ac.id/EEJ/article/view/6129/5033>
- Napaporn, S., Maneewan, S., Thamwipat, K., & Nittayathamkul, V. (2023). The cloud-powered hybrid learning process to enhance digital natives' analytical reading skills. *International Journal of Advanced Computer Science and Applications*, 14(1), 622-627. 10.14569/IJACSA.2023.0140168
- Peters, E., & Webb, S. (2018). Incidental vocabulary acquisition through viewing L2 television and factors that affect learning. *Studies in Second Language Acquisition*, 40(3), 551-577. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0272263117000407>

- Rukminingsih, Adnan, G., & Latief, M. A. (2020). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan. Penelitian Kuantitatif, Penelitian Kualitatif, Penelitian Tindakan Kelas* (1st ed). Erhaka Utama. <https://repository.ar-raniry.ac.id/id/eprint/14062/>
- Supriyadi, S. (2018). Penerapan Metode Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (Circ) Untuk Meningkatkan Kemampuan Siswa Dalam Berbicara Dengan Bahasa Inggris. *Jurnal Litbang: Media Informasi Penelitian, Pengembangan dan IPTEK*, 14(2), 131-138. <https://doi.org/10.33658/jl.v14i2.115>
- Telaumbanua, M. (2020). The Application of the Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) Learning Model in Improving the Ability to Find Elements of the Nonfiction Book for Class VII Students of SMP Negeri 1 Ma'u Nias Regency. *EDUCATION JOURNAL OF INDONESIA*, 1(1), 1-45. <https://publication.umsu.ac.id/index.php/eji/article/view/586/547>
- Wallner, L. (2019). Gutter talk: Co-constructing narratives using comics in the classroom. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research*, 63(6), 819–838. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00313831.2018.1452290>
- Yusuf, Q., Jusoh, Z., & Yusuf, Y. Q. (2019). Cooperative Learning Strategies to Enhance Writing Skills among Second Language Learners. *International Journal of Instruction*, 12(1), 1399-1412. <https://doi.org/10.29333/iji.2019.12189a>