Linguistic, English Education and Art (LEEA) Journal

Volume 7 Nomor 2, Januari-Juni 2024

e-ISSN: 2597-3819 p-ISSN: 2597-9248

DOI : https://doi.org/10.31539/leea.v7i2.8973



PORTFOLIO ASSESSMENT IN EFL WRITING CONTEXT IN INDONESIA: A SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW

Septiya Yuza¹

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia

Pupung Purnawarman²

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia

Didi Sukvadi³

Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia

septiyayuza@upi.edu1

Submit, 24-01-2024

Accepted, 20-06-2024

Publish, 23-06-2024

ABSTRACT

Portfolio assessment has been the focus of several EFL classroom research studies. However, this study is carried out to explore the development, implementation, and both teachers' and students' perceptions of portfolio assessment at the university and school levels in the Indonesian EFL writing context. Five hundred and Fifty-Five (n=555) journal articles were searched through different search engines, and only thirty-seven (n=37) recent and relevant publications published between the years 2012 to 2022 were met the criteria and included in this study, and the remaining are excluded. Among inclusions, there were twenty-one (n=21) qualitative research, twelve (n=12) quantitative, two (n=2) mix-mode, and two (n=2) review papers. The overall number of respondents in the studies was one thousand and fifty (n=1050). The findings of this research reveal that the use of portfolio assessment for assessing student writing had a significant positive effect and was able to improve students' writing skills. In accordance with their perceptions, both teachers and students responded well to the portfolio assessment. They agreed that it is essential to use this portfolio for writing in the EFL classroom since it generates substantial results throughout the writing process. Then, the development of the assessment portfolio in Indonesia has continued to progress in parallel with technological advances. The portfolio assessment tool, which is typically a paper-based portfolio, has started to transform into an electronic portfolio. By using e-portfolios, both students and teachers may evaluate writing more flexibly via digital platforms that are accessible anytime and anywhere.

Keywords: EFL, E-Portfolio Assessment, Indonesia, Portfolio Assessment, Writing.

INTRODUCTION

Assessment is an essential component of both the teaching and learning processes. As one of the elements of a curriculum, it is characterized as a set of procedures for tracking students' development, growth, and accomplishment toward a learning outcome (Shermis & DiVesta, 2011). Brown (2004) stated that evaluation is an ongoing process that involves a bigger range. Additionally, teachers may implement a variety of evaluations, such as multiple-choice questions, short answer questions, fill-in-the-blank questions, presentations, or role-play. As a result, it is always performed in real-time using any evidence to make decisions about learning and teaching (Walvoord, 2010). In other words, this assessment is used to indicate whether the teaching and learning process that has been carried out so far has been appropriate and has met the objectives.

There are numerous sorts of genuine assessments that may be employed in a classroom setting when it comes to English teaching and learning. O'Malley and Pierce (1996) distinguish three forms of genuine assessment: performance evaluations, portfolios, and self-assessments by students. Oral reports, written samples, solo or group projects, exhibitions, and demonstrations in which students answer verbally include performance evaluation. Writing, for example, requires students to complete complicated tasks that need them to assess past knowledge, current learning, and applicable abilities to solve issues. Another kind is a portfolio, which is made up of a systematic collection of student's work that is reviewed over time to demonstrate the student's progress toward educational goals. Lastly, self-assessment assures students that they can participate in the teaching-learning process with a high level of enthusiasm and confidence since it gives students the liberty to organize their own learning activities.

Foreign language students should master four fundamental skills: listening, speaking, reading, and writing (Sadiku, 2015). Writing continues to be one of the most difficult and time-consuming language skills for learners, particularly those learning a foreign language. Writing is seen as a difficult subject for students owing to its intricacy. It is considered an intellectually demanding work since it necessitates the writer's knowledge of multiple aspects concurrently (Bell & Burnaby, 1984; Nunan, 1989). These include the capacity to use structures, lexical elements, and their customary representation in everyday factual writing (Lado, 2000). Portfolio assessment, in the context of writing, maybe roughly characterized as an alternate instructional technique that successfully blends the teaching and evaluation of writing while emphasizing learner reflection (Hamp-Lyons & Condon, 2000; Lam, 2013). This paper, particularly, discusses portfolio assessment, especially in the context of teaching English as a foreign language in Indonesia over the last ten years or a decade (2012-2022).

LITERATURE REVIEW

Portfolio Assessment

In education, portfolio assessment has emerged for more than three decades (Lam, 2018). Since the 1980s, portfolios have garnered substantial attention from ESL authors and evaluation professionals (Hirvela & Sweetland, 2005). A portfolio assessment is described as a collection of texts generated by a writer over a certain period to meet the standards of a given setting (Hamp-Lyons & Condon, 2000). Yang (2003) states that portfolios reflect how far students' writing has come since the beginning of the semester. As defined by Paulson et al. (1991), a portfolio assessment is a collection of students' work that demonstrates the students' efforts, development, and accomplishments in one or more areas. This collection must contain student engagement in material selection, selection process, criteria for determining appropriateness, and evidence of student self-reflection.

In another study, a portfolio is best described as a focused collection of various documents that reflect a person's learning process (Imhof & Pickard, 2009). Kemp & Toperoff (1998) explain portfolio assessment in depth, stating that they include the following: first, a portfolio assessment is a collaborative effort between instructors and students. Second, it is not just an issue of gathering but also of selecting. Thirdly, it gives examples of students' work that demonstrate their growth over time, and the assessment criteria must be transparent to both the teacher and the students. From the explanations above, a portfolio assessment is a kind of assessment that teachers use to construct a full picture of their students' learning development by collecting their work over a specific period and analyzing it in a systematic and structured way. Data collection is utilized for evaluation purposes and to generate reports for other parties involved.

Crosby (1997) argues that the primary purpose of portfolios in the EFL setting is to increase students' motivation and establish a sense of autonomy in their study. The portfolio as a form of self-reflection is intriguing because it transforms the traditional writing grading system and develops a grading system in which the teacher shares power and interacts with students (Berlin, 1994 in Nezakatgoo, 2011). Portfolios have long been acknowledged as a comprehensive form of alternative evaluation for teachers and students (Smith & Yancey, 2000). Due to the fact that portfolio assessment is used to evaluate students' development and progress, the elements of the portfolio are selected by teachers and students or in collaboration with teachers and students. By developing and maintaining a controlled environment for tracking and assessing student work, all individuals get a better awareness of their own strengths and limitations and reflect on the development of compensatory approaches to increase student skills (Paulson et

al., 1991).

To analyze the reader's response, reception theory is needed. Why use reception theory? This theory is very suitable for analyzing the results of the reader's response because the reception is concerned with the opinion of the audience on media content or work; it can be a general opinion that can change to work (Endaswara, 2003: 118). Reception analysis theory supports the study of audiences who actually want to use audiences not merely passively but are seen ascultural agents who have their own power in producing meaning from various content discourses offered by the media. The meaning carried by the media can then be open or polysemic and can even be responded to in an oppositional way by the audience (Fiske, 2008).

In reception theory, according to Stuart Hall, there are two models, namely encoding and decoding. Encoding and Decoding a communication process; encoding is when the message to be conveyed is changed in the form of symbols in the form of sound/writing, and decoding is when the receiver translates the symbols in the form of sound/writing into meaning so that the message can be received as a whole (Morissan, 2013: 21). According to Hall there are three acceptance positions that individuals use to respond to media texts related to the conditions of the surrounding community. First Dominant, the Dominant-hegemonic position is the audience.

Portfolio Assessment on Writing

Portfolio assessment becomes an appealing alternate method for learners to improve their writing skills. According to Hart (1992), portfolios allow students to demonstrate their abilities rather than concentrating on their shortcomings, which he believes is beneficial for teaching students with low English proficiency. A portfolio is critical for students' writing development. It is a very successful educational strategy as well as a valid evaluation tool for demonstrating knowledge and abilities (Ma'arif et al., 2021). Additionally, portfolio assessment may provide realistic information about students' development and can be utilized to aid students in overcoming their writing anxieties while studying a foreign or second language (Brown, 2004; Hyland: 2003). (Moya & O'Malley, 1994) identified three benefits of portfolio assessment related to writing: It provides teachers with additional evidence and a broader range of samples from which to judge (Hamp-lyons & Condon, 1993); it enables the learners to be actively involved and reflect on the writing process (Murphy, 1994). Writing portfolios, which are composed of numerous versions of students' writing and various modes of learning, place a premium on the writing process and align with a processoriented teaching strategy. As an outcome, portfolio evaluation could improve students' writing (Hughes, 2003).

Students have traditionally been assigned to write in a "one-draft, one-reader" approach (Arndt, 1993). Students may adjust their drafts accordingly after receiving a grade and some comments from the teacher. Following that, the learning process is ostensibly complete, and students are assigned another subject to write about. The product method of writing encourages students to rely on the summative assessments of their teachers rather than assisting them in self-evaluating their drafts before submission. Adopting a portfolio approach in EFL writing classes may encourage students to take an active role in self-evaluation throughout the writing process (Weigle, 2007). Teachers reply to materials not to give an assessment in the form of a grade or mark but to provide editing recommendations and general remarks on the individual's growth as a writer. At the conclusion of the semester, instructors may like to assess portfolios that showcase what students have learned and their excellent work in class (Mousavi, 1999).

METHOD

This study is a systematic literature review utilizing PRISMA (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses) methodology, which is conducted in stages and in accordance with established research methods. A systematic review is a research method that attempts to explore, identify, and evaluate all past research results that are related to and pertinent to a certain topic, study, or current issue. Since systematic reviews are used to aggregate significant research findings, the provided data are comprehensive and objective. Formulation of research questions, systematic literature review searches, screening and selection of eligible research articles, and conclusion represent the systematic literature review. Several phases comprise the approach for this systematic review: 1) assemble Background and Purpose (Background and Objectives), 2) Research Question, and 3) Search the literature. 4) Criteria for Selection, 5) Method for Data Extraction, 6) Evaluate the Quality of Primary Studies, and 7) Data Synthesis.

This research was conducted in March-June 2022. Literature search results related to the topic were found by utilizing the keywords: "Portfolio Assessment" + "Writing" + "EFL" + "Indonesia." These databases are used to sort articles related to keywords: Google Scholar, Science Direct, Elsevier, Research Gate, and DOAJ.

The search and article selection process was guided by inclusion criteria. Publications on portfolio assessment in EFL classes, specifically in the context of writing in Indonesia, published in national and international journals from 2012-2022 or the last decade that were indexed in the database utilized. Numerous

(n=555) publications resulted from the initial search and were screened by reviewing the titles, keywords, and abstracts. However, most of the research studies did not meet the inclusion requirement. Based on the selection criteria, only the articles addressing the stated research objectives for the current study were focused. Finally, a total of 37 journal articles were eligible for the systematic review and were included in the dataset for analysis.

FINDING

Methods Used for Reviewed Studies

A systematic review of 555 articles published between 2012-2022 found only 37 empirical studies that met the inclusion criteria.

Table 1. Research Method

Method	Frequency	Percentage
Qualitative	21	56.75%
Quantitative	12	32.43%
Mixed	2	5.40%
Review Paper	2	5.40%
Total	37	100%

Summary of participants in the review

Table 2. Summary of Participants

Participants	Frequency	Percentage
Teachers	54	5.15%
Students	996	94.85
Total	1050	100%

Main Finding

Table 3. Finding of Reviewed Articles

Author(s) and Date	Study	Method	Participant	Findings
Syafei (2012)	Backwash Effects of Portfolio Assessment in Academic Writing Classes.	Qualitative	70 students of the English Education Department	The finding revealed that the students responded positively to the portfolio assessment. Thus, it is recommended that the application of portfolio assessment in academic writing classes be maintained.
Arrista, Saun & Tiarina (2013)	Portfolio- Based Writing Assessment on Students' Ability in Writing a Descriptive Text.	Quantitative	64 students of tenth- grade students	The result of this research showed that there was a significant effect on the experimental group after getting the treatment. Therefore, the portfolio-based writing assessment could have a better effect on students' ability to write descriptive text.

Hartono, H. (2014)	Online Peer Feedback in EFL Writing Class: How It Improves Students" Writing and The Problems the Students Face.	Quantitative	26 students of the English Teacher Education Department	Teachers' weblogs can be utilized to apply portfolio assessment by giving students access to post their writing works on the weblogs. This practical model of portfolio not only eases the teacher but also encourages the students to learn collaboratively.
Eridafithri (2015)	The application of portfolios to assess progress in the writing of EFL students at secondary schools in Banda Aceh.	Quantitative	26 teachers	The results of this study showed that a large percentage of teachers found it difficult to design a rubric/set of instructions for using portfolios for writing assessment, whilst, from the observation, it was revealed that the complexities of correcting portfolios discouraged them from using portfolios as one of their means of assessment.
Vonti (2016)	Relationship Between Learning Motivation, Portfolio Based Assessment, and Students' Writing Ability.	Quantitative	Two classes in the second semester of the English Department with 56 students	The result is a positive relationship between portfolio-based assessment and the student's writing ability. From the data analysis, it was found that the students who got high scores in their portfolio projects obtained high scores on the writing tests.
Matra, S.D. (2016).	E-Portfolio: Beyond Assessment for English Student Teachers	Qualitative	Three big groups from different language levels. The total number of participants is unknown	The study shows that the Students feel positive and engaged in sharing their teaching reflections with their peers. E-portfolio prepares tomorrow's teachers to use technology critically and reflectively and improve current teachers' practices.
Hanifa, R. (2017)	Teachers' view on the use of portfolio assessment in secondary schools in Indonesia	Qualitative	Four teachers	The result of the study obviously indicated that the contents of students' portfolios comprised a wide range of topics in different genres. Furthermore, teachers' understanding of the implementation of portfolios as a means of evaluating students' learning was highly good.

Efendi, Z., Usman, B., & Muslim, A. (2017).	Implementatio n of portfolio assessment in teaching English writing	Quantitative	30 students	There was a significant improvement in the students' writing skills and their responses after teaching by using portfolio assessment. It was concluded that the use of portfolio assessment can increase students' writing skills and their responses.
Refnaldi, R.,Zaim,M ,, & Moria, E. (2017)	Teachers' Need for Authentic Assessment to Assess Writing Skills at Grade VII of Junior High Schools in Teluk Kuantan	Qualitative	20 English teachers at junior high schools	The teachers need several types of authentic assessments that are appropriate to assess students' writing skills.
Afrianto, A. (2017)	Challenges of using portfolio assessment as an alternative assessment method for teaching English in Indonesian schools	Review Paper	-	Despite many potential benefits, the use of portfolio assessment is limited by some issues such as lower reliability, high cost, high demand for well-trained professional teachers, and unsupported learning atmosphere in Indonesia.
Suherman, A. (2018)	Examining students' perceptions of using the portfolio as an assessment tool in an EFL writing classroom	Qualitative	28 Indonesian tertiary-level EFL learners	The findings revealed two main points. First, most of the students argued that a portfolio was an effective tool to assess their writing tasks. Second, portfolios seemed to benefit students by reflecting on their previous writing tasks.
Nopita, D. (2018)	The Influence of Portfolio Assessment in Improving the Quality of Teaching English Foreign Language (EFL) Writing	Quantitative	30 students in the third semester who took Essay Writing	In short, the result of portfolio assessment can be used as one of the considerations in evaluating the context, the input, the process, and the product of the EFL writing course.
Pakasi, J. H., & Beal, J. (2018).	Portfolio Assessment for An Undergraduate Intermediate-	Quantitative	20 students	The study results show that the portfolios were useful for comparing students' writing over the course of the semester. There was

	Level Writing Class			significant improvement in the content and organization of students' writing, while the results of grammar were less consistent depending on the individual factors and error type.
Usadiati, W., & Norahmi, M (2018).	Portfolio as a student's assessment tool: lesson learned	Quantitative	29 students taking English Teaching Media subject at the English Education Study Program	The results revealed both the advantages and limitations of portfolio for the student's final evaluation and the possibilities of optimization as an assessment tool for the lecturers to reflectively think about their practices.
Matra, S. D. (2018).	English Student Teachers' Reflections on E-Portfolio Assessment	Qualitative	The the population of the study is 76 students; 36 students in A class, 25 students in B class and 15 students in an Evening class.	Students can increase responsibility for their own learning by recording and reflecting on their learning in an E-portfolio. Students can carry their E-portfolio throughout their lifelong learning journey and use it to record, assess, evaluate, and reflect at any time. Students can increase their ability to learn by taking ownership of and developing strategies for self-assessment, as well as monitoring their own development.
Dahviyanti , W. N. G. (2019)	Using Portfolio Assessment to Improve EFL Students' expository- writing Performance	Qualitative	31 students	The result showed that portfolio assessment had improved EFL students' expository writing performance.
Halim, I. A., Hartati, A., & Lestari, Z. W. (2019).	The Use of Portfolio Assessment of Writing Skills in Descriptive Text	Qualitative	1 Teacher	Based on the research findings, the teacher implemented almost all the procedures of portfolio assessment proposed by Brown & Abeywickrama, the teacher designed the purpose of the portfolio, the teacher designed the material of the portfolio, The teacher designed the time for the portfolio, the time for

				reviewing, and the place for the portfolio.
Sumarno, W. K., & Tatik, M. (2019)	Using Edmodo- Supported E- Portfolio as Authentic Assessment in EFL Writing Course	Quantitative	13 first-year students	Results indicated that students' writings with e-portfolio outperformed their writing quality when using paper-based portfolios. Therefore, the implementation of an Edmodo-supported e-portfolio is recommended for the writing course.
Listiana, I., Yusuf, F.N., & Isman, S.M. (2020)	Portfolio Assessment: Benefits for Students at Different Writing Proficiency Levels	Qualitative	32 students	The results show that every level of writing proficiency has a different percentage of improvement, and the low-level students have the least improvement; they produce fewer sentences. The research also found that every level of writing proficiency had problems, which were mainly in content, organization, conventions, and vocabulary, while the low-level proficiency had another problem in gaining confidence to produce sentences.
Tyas, P. A. (2020)	Promoting students' autonomous learning using portfolio assessment in EFL writing class	Qualitative	30 students enrolled in Essay Writing Class	The results prove that portfolio assessment can promote students autonomous learning since it provides some benefits for students, such as motivating them to do self-evaluation and reflection, encouraging them to be actively involved in peer review sessions, and enhancing their awareness of their weaknesses.
Sulistyo, T., Eltris, K. P. N., Mafulah, S., Budianto, S., Saiful, S., & Heriyawati , D. F. (2020)	Portfolio assessment: Learning outcomes and students' attitudes	Mixed Method	62 students	The results show that the implementation of a portfolio assessment increased the students' writing ability. It was also found that the students' knowledge of global issues (content and organization) also increased more significantly than the local issues (grammar, vocabulary, and mechanics).
Utama, T. P. (2020).	Portfolio System in	Qualitative	Four students	This research found that the students implemented a

	Teaching Writing: EFL Students' Perceptions			portfolio system to improve their English writing skills. This research stands as a contribution to teaching English writing skills.
Virgin, J. A., & Bharati, D. A. L. (2020)	Teachers' Perception, Plan, and Implementatio n of Portfolio Assessment in Students' Writing Assessment	Qualitative	2 English teachers from different school levels	The results of the analysis revealed that both teachers had a positive perception of portfolio assessment in students' writing assessments.
Hudori, R. F. A., Tasnim, Z., Fardhani, A.E., & Sari, D. P. (2020	The Use of Portfolio Assessment in English Writing Classes	Qualitative	Unknown	The research findings indicated that assessing writing by using portfolio assessment is good and useful, and it has a good effect on the quality of teaching learning process in English writing classes.
Mukhsinah , A. F. (2020).	The Use of E- portfolio Assessment to Improve Students' Writing Ability	Quantitative	68 students	The result of this study showed that both groups had improved scores on the posttest after the treatment. However, the experimental group had statistically higher scores than the control group.
Taufik, M., & Cahyono, B. Y. (2020)	Developing EFL Students' Writing Skills Through Self- Assessment Integrated With E- Portfolio	Qualitative	25 students	The findings showed that the student's writing skills could be improved after the implementation of self-assessment integrated with e-portfolios. It is suggested that EFL teachers consider using self-assessment integrated with students' e-portfolios to help improve EFL student's writing skills.
Hakim, P. K., & Srisudarso, M. (2020)	A Washback Study on Portfolio Assessment	Qualitative	Unknown	The findings suggest that a portfolio is indeed appropriate for writing and translating subjects. Portfolio-based assessments generate a positive washback effect on the learning process. The results discovered positive wash-back.
Rukmining sih, R.	Integrating Declarative	Mixed Method	80 students	The finding showed that there is a significant difference in

(2020)	and Procedural Knowledge on Grammar through E- Portfolio Assessment			students' understanding of grammar between the experimental group and the control group. E-portfolios through students' blogs give students the opportunity to engage in their efforts, progress, and achievements in given areas, and the strategy has the additional benefit of enabling students to publish and share ideas or tasks easily, involving an authentic audience or their classmates.
Darwanto, B. A., Surjono, H. D., & Ciptaningr um, D. S. (2020)	Newly innovated E- portfolio to Promote Dynamic Collective Evaluation of Students' Extramural English Written Artifacts	Quantitative	25 students	The data confirms that the hold system is effective in building both individual and collaborative participation and pushing students to get extensively and collectively involved in the dynamic online evaluation.
Ma'arif, A. S., Abdullah, F., Fatimah, A. S., & Hidayati, A. N. (2021)	Portfolio- based assessment in English language learning: Highlighting the students' perceptions	Qualitative	Two students	The findings revealed that students articulated their perceptions in three major themes, namely developing self-monitoring from the student's learning processes, generating discipline, responsible and autonomous language learning attitudes, and mitigating perceptual mismatches among teachers and students.
Syafei, M., Mujiyanto, J., Yuliasri, I., & Pratama, H. (2021)	Students' Perception of the Application of Portfolio Assessment during the COVID-19 Pandemic	Qualitative	86 students	The results imply that the portfolio assessment made it easier for students to study online while following health protocols during the pandemic.
Setiawan, A., & Mulyadi, D. (2021)	The Portfolio Assessment to Teach Writing of Opinion Essay	Qualitative	75 students	The results showed that the implementation of portfolio assessment could help students write opinion essays by considering their structure and writing components.

Bning Puspita Natin, S. S., & Andayani, M. A (2021)	The Implementatio n of Portfolio Assessment in the English Class at Junior High School: A Case Study	Qualitative	One teacher	The result of this research revealed that the English teacher had implemented the portfolio assessment based on the student's needs as well as their conditions.
Hafiz, H. S., Hakim, M. I., & Harun, M. A. (2021)	The Effectiveness of Portfolio Assessment in English Writing Skills of Islamic Junior High School	Quantitative	34 students	The findings show that there is a significant difference in the mean score between students' writing before and after treatment.
Ariningsih, N. K. D., Artini, L. P., & Marsakaw ati, N. P. E. (2021)	The Effect of E-Portfolio in Project-Based Learning Toward Learner Autonomy and Writing Competency	Quantitative	Two classes randomly of 11 classes (total unknown)	The results of this study showed that the E-portfolio has a significant effect on project-based learning in terms of learner autonomy and writing competency. The mean score of students who were taught by using an e-portfolio in a project-based learning strategy is higher than the mean score of those who were taught by using a conventional strategy.
Mantra, I. B. N., Budiningsi h, D. N., Astuti, P. S., & Puspawati, D. A. (2021)	A Portrayal of Portfolio as an Alternative Online Learning Assessment	Review Paper	-	This study revealed that portfolio assessment is an effective assessment to be used to assess the student's competence through online learning systems.

Nopitasari,	Portfolio-	Qualitative	unknown	Portfolio assessment-based
D., &	Based			instruction should be based on
Tristan,	Instruction:			real-life topics, authentic,
I.T.U.	The			interactive, and presenting
(2022)	Perspective			domestic and international
	and Response			viewpoints.
	In Teaching			Besides, the
	Writing For			development of portfolio
	Secondary			assessment-based instruction
	High School			to improve the
	In Makassar			writing components such as
	(An			literacy and comprehension
	Experimental			
	Study)			

DISCUSSION

The Development of Portfolio Assessment in Indonesia

Portfolio assessment is one of the authentic assessments that has been used for a long time in EFL classes. In the last ten years in Indonesia (2012-2022), the application of portfolio assessment, especially in the context of writing, has continued to evolve following the times and needs. The use of portfolio assessment, which was previously only done classically, is now starting to be combined with available technology, from paper-portfolio assessment to eportfolio assessment. This is evidenced by the existence of research beginning with Hartono (2014), which used a model of a teacher's weblog with a Facebook login. The students were expected to post their writing assignments on the teacher's blog at www.colasula.com as an alternative to submitting them on paper. By allowing students to upload their writing efforts on the teacher's blog, portfolio evaluation may be implemented. This practical portfolio approach not only facilitates collaborative learning among students but also facilitates the teacher's work. Receiving or delivering peer critique may help students enhance the quality of their work. Following Matra (2016), who conducted a pilot experiment on the use of e-portfolios in micro-teaching courses. Participants in this research created e-portfolios in which they gave critical reflection on the learning experience and substantiated their arguments with relevant artifacts. These portfolios included the abilities and competencies acquired by students throughout the micro-teaching class. Students can assess their own learning and are thus more prepared for their teaching practicum in the following semester. Then, Matra (2018) continued an investigation in which the data demonstrated that E-portfolios may represent the learning process and development of students. ICT as a multimedia tool provides an additional opportunity to acquire non-written content. Technology facilitates the use of a variety of media, including video, audio, and photos, in addition to text, to demonstrate both the learning process and the end results. The English student does the three core actions of gathering, choosing, and reflecting, which are then posted to www.e-portfolio.online. Sumarno and Tatik (2019) conducted research by using Edmodo to enhance portfolio assessment. Utilizing Edmodo, various writing exercises may be completed online under the supervision of the instructor. Therefore, each level of process writing may be completed by students and assessed by the teacher. The students' feeling of authorship will also increase as they go through a series of developmental processes to produce their greatest final drafts. It demonstrates that combining portfolios with digital technologies may be advantageous.

The appearance of COVID-19, an unexpectedly dangerous virus originating in China, has drastically altered the lives of a variety of individuals starting from the end of 2019. As a result of the COVID-19 pandemic, several colleges, schools, and institutions have stopped face-to-face classes and accelerated the transition to online learning. In conclusion, examinations are administered online, campuses and libraries are closed, and overseas study programs have been postponed. Fortunately, in this internet world, synchronous or online learning is one of the methods employed to fight the current pandemic. Due to this outbreak, the use of e-portfolios to maintain health protocols has become widespread, without disregarding the significance of objectives in developing writing abilities. Mukhsinah (2020) found that the usage of eportfolios, which use technology as a tool in the teaching-learning process, may help students improve their writing skills. Similarly, Taufik and Cahyono (2020) advised that EFL instructors explore integrating self-assessment with students' eportfolios to enhance EFL students' writing ability. Later, Rukminingsih (2020) conducted research on the integration of declarative and procedural grammar knowledge using e-portfolio. E-portfolios via student blogs provide students with the ability to demonstrate their efforts, development, and accomplishments in certain areas, and the technique has the added advantage of allowing students to publish and share ideas or assignments with genuine audiences or their peers. Integrating declarative and procedural knowledge in a Grammar course via the use of an E-Portfolio assessment was shown to be a successful method.

Darwanto et al. (2020) evaluated if an e-portfolio with its hold system might encourage students to participate in an online collective-dynamic assessment. Through the old system, each upload is certain to get collective assessments not only from the class participants but also from other system inhabitants: other teachers, peers, self, and even students of other classes who have joined the system. Moreover, using this approach, the score is more responsible since at least as many peers evaluate the petition as the computer does, and the

ranking is more equitable because the petition is pushed. When one disagrees with a particular score, he or she may always submit a petition with arguments. Last, Ariningsih et al. (2021) examined the impact of e-portfolios in project-based learning on learner autonomy and writing competence. The mean score of students taught with an e-portfolio in a project-based learning approach is greater than the mean score of students taught with a traditional method. E-portfolios in Project-Based Learning also highlighted the potential for fostering students' creativity, problem-solving abilities, and communication via technological proficiency.

The Implementation of Portfolio Assessment in Indonesia

Start with the research of Saun and Tiarina (2013), which studied how the use of portfolio-based writing evaluation as an alternative assessment improved students' descriptive text writing skills. They discovered that the portfolio-based writing assessment might have a greater impact on students' descriptive writing skills. Halim et al. (2019) investigated the usage of portfolio assessment of writing ability in descriptive text as well as the obstacles experienced by teachers when using portfolio assessment of writing ability in descriptive text. The teacher determined the portfolio's objective, its contents, its duration, its review time, and its location. Moreover, the teacher has difficulty providing feedback in a large class, exerts less control and guidance over the students, and does not utilize a rubric to evaluate the writing ability of the student's assignment. Then, Dahviyanti (2019) conducted similar research regarding the performance of EFL students in expository writing. The outcome showed that portfolio evaluation enhanced the expository writing skills of EFL students.

Efendi et al. (2017) conducted a pre-experimental study using a one-group pre-test and post-test design and a descriptive analysis of students' answers to portfolio evaluation for teaching English writing. The use of portfolio assessment may improve students' writing abilities and answers. The same experimental work was conducted by Hafiz et al. (2021). The results indicate that there is a statistically significant difference in the mean score of students' writing before and after treatment. Even though there is a positive relationship between portfolio assessment and students' writing ability, the assessment of teachers should include well-prepared materials, assignments, and other activities, and it should be conducted in small classes since it is easier to handle. Still, the same topic concerning the implementation of portfolio assessment (Pakasi & Beal, 2018; Elyza, 2018; Sulistyo et al., 2020; Setiawan & Mulyadi,2021; and Bning & Andayani, 2021) concluded that the implementation of portfolio assessment improved students' writing skills.

Usadiati and Norahmi (2018) studied the possibility of portfolios as an assessment tool in the final evaluation of students' performance. The portfolio

performance of the students was evaluated on a scale ranging from 1 (below the standard, emerging) to 4 (exceeds the standard, exemplary). The findings indicated both the benefits and limits of portfolios as a final evaluative instrument for students, as well as their optimization potential as a tool for lecturers to reflect on their practices. In the meanwhile, Vonti (2016) established the connection between learning motivation, portfolio-based evaluation, and students' writing skills. Students' learning motivation has a substantial, strong relation with their writing ability, and portfolio-based evaluation has a positive relationship with their writing ability. Regarding various levels of writing proficiency, Listiana et al. (2020) revealed that each level of writing proficiency had a distinct percentage of progress, with low-level pupils exhibiting the least development; they generated fewer sentences. The study also revealed that all levels of writing skill had challenges, mostly in the areas of content, organization, conventions, and vocabulary, with the lowest level of proficiency also having difficulty getting the confidence to compose sentences. This research suggests that teachers should additionally provide students with comprehensive corrections and feedback to enable them to develop.

Later, Tyas (2020) explored the use of portfolio assessment to encourage students' autonomous learning at one of Indonesia's most prestigious universities. The findings demonstrate that portfolio assessment may boost students' independent learning because it motivates them to engage in self-evaluation and reflection, encourages them to participate actively in peer review sessions, and heightens their knowledge of their inadequacies. Briefly, Portfolio evaluation may be used as one of the criteria for assessing the context, input, process, and result of an EFL writing course (Nopita, 2018).

Despite the fact that several studies demonstrate the advantages of adopting portfolio evaluation in writing courses, there were still schools that had not completely applied the approach. This cannot be separated from the difficulties encountered. Eridafithri (2015) responded to questions pertaining to the challenges encountered by teachers; hence, they did not use this portfolio assessment. Observation revealed that the complexity of correcting portfolios discouraged teachers from using portfolios as one of their assessment tools. The results of this study revealed that a large percentage of teachers found it difficult to design a rubric/set of instructions for using portfolios for writing assessments, while the complexity of correcting portfolios discouraged them from using portfolios as one of their assessment tools. Following Afrianto (2017), in his literature review study, the utilization of portfolio assessment in Indonesia is constrained by concerns such as low dependability, high cost, high demand for professionally educated teachers, and an unsupported educational environment. In

addition, Halim et al. (2019) described the challenges faced by the teacher in the use of portfolio assessment of writing skills, declaring that the teacher has difficulty providing feedback in a large class, less difficulty controlling and guiding students, and did not use a rubric to evaluate the writing skill of the student's task. Through his study, Refnaldi et al. (2017) determine if authentic assessment is necessary for assessing writing abilities. The results suggest that teachers need straightforward analytical scoring rubrics. Clearly, teachers need a variety of real, relevant assessments to evaluate students' writing skills. Even though teachers had a decent understanding of portfolio assessment, Virgin & Bharati's (2020) research showed that their knowledge was inadequate. The review of lesson plans by two participants revealed that teachers had unplanned portfolio development. According to their class arrangements, the processes and criteria for their portfolios could not be located. The creation and execution of teachers' portfolios are less effective. This was due to the lack of portfolio preparation by teachers, the absence of self-evaluation and reflection by students, and the absence of a written rubric for assessment. Time management, storage, and portfolio rubric were the primary obstacles instructors encountered throughout the portfolio development process.

Teachers' Perception of portfolio assessment in EFL writing classes

Hanifa (2017) explored teachers' perspectives on the usage of portfolio evaluation in Indonesian secondary schools. The teachers' comprehension of the deployment of student portfolios as a mechanism for assessing student learning was excellent. Then, Virgin and Bharati (2020) explored Teachers' perceptions, plans, and Implementation of Portfolio assessments for Students' Writing assessments. The research found that both teachers viewed portfolio assessment in students' writing evaluation positively. Their agreement and positive views on portfolio creation and implementation, its usefulness as an educational instrument, and its impact on instructional practices, teacher and student roles, and duties throughout portfolio development confirmed this. In addition, Nopitasari & Tristan (2022) noted that teachers' response to the basic writing skill integrated with daily life and curriculum at the school facilitates learning that is quick, pleasurable, enjoyable, more communicative, more collaborative, and enables students to learn anytime, anywhere, in and out of the classroom more independently.

Students' Perception of portfolio assessment in EFL writing classes

Syafei (2012) implies that students respond positively to portfolio assessment and that it has favorable consequences on their learning. Therefore, it is advised that its use in the teaching and learning process of academic writing courses be maintained. Suherman (2018) evaluated the perceptions of EFL writing

students about the use of portfolios as an evaluation method. The majority of students stated that a portfolio was a good tool for assessing their writing assignments, and the portfolios seemed to help students by encouraging them to reflect on their prior writing assignments. Then, Utama (2020) analyzed students' perceptions of the Portfolio System in Teaching Writing. The students appreciated establishing a portfolio system to enhance their English writing abilities, and this research demonstrates that portfolios are an effective instrument for teaching English writing skills in secondary school.

Afterward, Ma'arif et al. (2021) emphasized the students' perspective on Portfolio-based evaluation in English language acquisition. The findings revealed that students articulated their perceptions in three major themes: developing self-monitoring from the student's learning processes, fostering disciplined, responsible, and autonomous language learning attitudes, and minimizing perceptual mismatches between teachers and students. This research reveals that portfolio assessment employment may give students the chance to examine their learning progress and boost their self-confidence and willingness to learn. Recently, during the COVID-19 pandemic, Syafei et al. (2021) discovered that the majority of students who consented to portfolio assessment claimed compliance with health guidelines, process-oriented, active learning, greater organization, schedule flexibility, and self-directed learning as justifications. During the pandemic, portfolio assessment also allows for the maintenance of a synchronous or asynchronous teaching and learning process.

CONCLUSION

This study presents a systematic review of empirical studies published between 2012 and 2022 on portfolio assessment in EFL writing classrooms. First, based on the study that has been conducted, it can be determined that the implementation of portfolio assessment for assessing writing has had a significant positive effect and was able to increase students' writing abilities. In other words, portfolio assessment is crucial for evaluating students' writing skills. Even though applying this portfolio assessment has many advantages, it cannot be separated from the obstacles that must be overcome, such as poor dependability, high cost, high demand for well-trained professional instructors, and an unsupported learning environment in Indonesia. Then, in relation to the development of the assessment portfolio in Indonesia, it has continued to evolve in accordance with technological advancements during 2012-2022. The portfolio assessment tool, which is typically a paper-based portfolio, has started to transform into an electronic portfolio. By using e-portfolios, both students and teachers may evaluate writing more flexibly via digital platforms that are accessible anytime,

anywhere. In order to preserve distance and comply with appropriate health protocols, the normal face-to-face learning method must be replaced with an online approach to battle the worldwide COVID-19 pandemic. In the meanwhile, based on the perceptions of teachers and students, the findings of the linked study indicated that both teachers and students responded positively to portfolio assessment. They agreed that it is essential to utilize this portfolio for writing in the EFL classroom since it generates substantial outcomes in the writing process. In conclusion, with technological advancements, portfolio assessment must keep evolving to meet the demands of the present. Combining paper-based portfolios with electronic portfolios may be a feasible option. Examining the current condition of education, which continues to evolve as a result of a rapid pandemic, it is clear that innovative techniques, such as the use of e-portfolios, represent a breakthrough. To address the obstacles inherent in the process of implementing portfolio assessment, it is important for teachers and connected stakeholders to conduct additional portfolio assessment training.

REFERENCES

- Afrianto, A. (2017). Challenges Of Using Portfolio Assessment as An Alternative Assessment Method for Teaching English in Indonesian Schools. *International Journal of Educational Best Practices*, 1(2), 106–114.
- Ariningsih, N. K. D., Artini, L. P., & Marsakawati, N. P. E. (2021). The Effect Of E-Portfolio in Project-Based Learning Toward Learner Autonomy and Writing Competency. *Journal of Education Research and Evaluation*, 5(1), 154-160.
- Arndt, V. (1993). Response To Writing: Using Feedback to Inform the Writing Process. In M. Brock & L. Walters (Eds.), Writing Around the Pacific Rim(Pp.90–114). Clevedon, U.K.: Multilingual Matters.
- Bell, J., & Burnaby, B. (1984). A Handbook for ESL Literacy. Oise Press.
- Bning Puspita Natin, S. S., & Andayani, M. A. (2021). The Implementation of Portfolio Assessment in The English Class at Junior High School: A Case Study.
- Brown, D. (2004). *Language Assessment: Principles and Classroom Practice*. Pearson Education.
- Brown, H.D. (2004). Language Assessment: Principles and Classroom Practices. Longman.
- Crosby, C. (1997). Portfolio Assessment in The Korean ESL Writing Classroom. *Thai TESOL Bulletin*, 10(2).
- Dahviyanti, W. N. G. (2019). Using Portfolio Assessment to Improve EFL Students' Expository-Writing Performance. *International Journal of Humanities and Innovation (IJHI)*, 2(1), 1–6.
- Darwanto, B. A., Surjono, H. D., & Ciptaningrum, D. S. (2020). Newly Innovated E-Portfolio to Promote Dynamic Collective Evaluation on Students'

- Extramural English Written Artifacts. Computer-Assisted Language Learning Electronic Journal, 21(2), 32-51.
- Efendi, Z., Usman, B., & Muslem, A. (2017). Implementation Of Portfolio Assessment in Teaching English Writing. *English Education Journal*, 8(2), 187-198.
- Elyza, F. (2018). Portfolio Assessment Impact to The Students' paragraph Writing. *Visipena*, 9(1), 193-202.
- Eridafithri, E. (2015). The Application of Portfolios to Assess Progress in Writing of EFL Students at Secondary Schools In Banda Aceh. *Studies In English Language and Education*, 2(1), 1-15.
- Hafiz, H. S., Hakim, M. I., & Harun, M. A. (2021). The Effectiveness of Portofolio Assessment in English Writing Skill of Islamic Junior High School. *Journal Of Research and Educational Research Evaluation*, 10(1), 28-36.
- Hakim, P. K., & Srisudarso, M. (2020). A Washback Study on Portfolio Assessment. *ELT In Focus*, *3*(1), 9-14.
- Halim, I. A., Hartati, A., & Lestari, Z. W. (2019). The Use of Portfolio Assessment of Writing Skill In Descriptive Text. *JALL (Journal of Applied Linguistics and Literacy)*, 3(2), 75-85.
- Hamp-Lyons, L., & Condon, W. (1993). Questioning Assumptions About Portfolio-Based Assessment. *College Composition and Communication*, 44(2), 176–190.
- Hamp-Lyons, L., & Condon, W. (2000). Assessing The Portfolio: Issues for Research Theory and Practice. Cresskill, NJ: Hampton Press.
- Hanifa, R. (2017). Teachers' View on The Use of Portfolio Assessment in Secondary Schools in Indonesia. *Date Of Access*, 14(4), 18.
- Hart, D. (1994). *Authentic Assessment*. Menlo Park, CA: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company.
- Hartono, H. (2014). Online Peer Feedback in EFL Writing Class: How It Improves Students' Writing and The Problems The Students Face.
- Hirvela, A., & Sweetland, Y. L. (2005). Two Case Studies of L2 Writers' Experiences Across Learning-Directed Portfolio Contexts. *Assessing Writing*, 10(3), 192–213.
- Hudori, R. F. A., Tasnim, Z., Fardhani, A. E., & Sari, D. P. (2020). The Use of Portfolio Assessment in English Writing Classes. In IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science (Vol. 485, No. 1, P. 012093). IOP Publishing.
- Hughes, A. (2003). Testing For Language Teachers. (2ed.). Cambridge University
- Hyland, K. (2003). Second Language Writing. Cambridge University Press. Imhof, M. & Picard, C. (2009). Views On Using Portfolios in Teacher Education. *Teaching And Teacher Education*. 25, 149–154.
- Kemp, J., & Toperoff, D. (1998). Guidelines For Portfolio Assessment. Lado, R. (2000). *Language Testing: Writing in A Foreign Language*. Longman.

- Lam, R. (2013). Promoting Self-Regulated Learning Through Portfolio Assessment: Testimony and Recommendations. Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education, 39(6), 699–714.
- Lam, R. (2018). Portfolio Assessment for The Teaching and Learning of Writing. *Springer*.
- Listiana, I., Yusuf, F. N., & Isman, S. M. (2020). Portfolio Assessment: Benefits for Students at Different Writing Proficiency Level. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Dan Sastra*, 20(2), 243-256.
- Ma'arif, A. S., Abdullah, F., Fatimah, A. S., & Hidayati, A. N. (2021). Portfolio-Based Assessment in English Language Learning: Highlighting the Students' Perceptions. *J-SHMIC: Journal of English for Academic*, 8(1), 1-11.
- Mantra, I. B. N., Budiningsih, D. N., Astuti, P. S., & Puspawati, D. A. (2021). A Portrayal of Portfolio as An Alternative Online Learning Assessment. *International Journal of Social Sciences*, 4(2), 249-254.
- Matra, S. D. (2016). E-Portfolio: Beyond Assessment for English Student Teacher. The 5th English Language Teaching, Literature, And Translation, 607.
- Matra, S. D. (2018). English Student Teachers' Reflections On E-Portfolio Assessment. In English Language and Literature International Conference (Ellic). *Proceedings*, 2, 284–282.
- Mousavi, S. A. (1999). *A Dictionary of Language Testing*. 2nded. Tehran: Rahnama.
- Moya, S. S., & O'Malley, J. M. (1994). A Portfolio Assessment Model For ESL. The Journal of Educational Issues Of Language Minority Students, 13(1), 13–36.
- Mukhsinah, A. F. (2020). The Use Of E-Portfolio Assessment to Improve Students' Writing Ability. *RETAIN*, 8(2).
- Murphy, S. (1994). Portfolios And Curriculum Reform: Patterns in Practice. Assessing Writing, 1(2), 175–206. Nezakatgoo, B (2011). The Effects of Portfolio Assessment on Writing of EFL Students. *English Language Teaching*, 4(2), 231.
- Nopita, D. (2018). The Influence of Portfolio Assessment in Improving The Quality Of Teaching English Foreign Language (EFL) Writing. In First Indonesian Communication Forum of Teacher Training And Education Faculty Leaders International Conference on Education 2017 (ICE 2017). Atlantis Press, 411–414.
- Nopitasari, D., & Tristan, I. T. U. (2022). Portfolio Based Instruction the Perspective and Response in Teaching Writing for Secondary High School in Makassar (An Experimental Study). *Klasikal: Journal of Education, Language Teaching and Science*, 4(1), 118-125.
- Nunan, D. (1989). *Designing Tasks for The Communicative Classroom*. Cambridge University Press.
- O'Malley, J.M., & Pierce, L. Valdez (1996). Authentic Assessment for English Language Learners Practical Approaches For Teachers. Addison Wesley Publishing Company.

- Pakasi, J. H., & Beal, J. (2018). Portfolio Assessment for An Undergraduate Intermediate Level Writing Class. *Edusentris*, 5(2), 91-113.
- Paulson, F. L., Paulson, P. R. & Meyer, C. A. (1991). What Makes a Portfolio A Portfolio? *Educational Leadership*, 60-63.
- Perry, A., & Hammond, N. (2002). Systematic Reviews: The Experiences of a PhD Student. *Psychology Learning & Teaching*, 2(1), 32–35.
- Refnaldi, R., Zaim, M., & MORIA, E. (2017, May). Teachers' Need for Authentic Assessment to Assess Writing Skill at Grade VII of Junior High Schools in Teluk Kuantan. In Fifth International Seminar on English Language and Teaching (ISELT 2017). *Atlantis Press*, 179–185.
- Rukminingsih, R. (2020). Integrating Declarative and Procedural Knowledge on Grammar Through E-Portfolio Assessment. *Jurnal Edukasi: Kajian Ilmu Pendidikan*, 6(1), 37-54.
- Sadiku, L. M. (2015). The Importance of Four Skills: Reading, Speaking, Writing, Listening in A Lesson Hour. *European Journal of Language and Literature*, *1*(1), 29-31.
- Saun, S., & Tiarina, Y. (2013). A Portfolio-Based Writing Assessment on Students'ability in Writing A Descriptive Text. *Journal Of English Language Teaching*, 1(2), 333-340.
- Setiawan, A., & Mulyadi, D. (2021). The Portfolio Assessment to Teach Writing of Opinion Essay. *Language Circle: Journal of Language and Literature*, 15(2), 329-336.
- Shermis, M. D., & Divesta, F. J. (2011). *Classroom Assessment in Action*. Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Smith, J. B. & Blake Yancey, K. (2000). Self-Assessment and Development in Writing: A Collaborative Inquiry. Hampton Press.
- Suherman, A. (2018, December). Examining Students' Perceptions of Using Portfolio as An Assessment Tool in An EFL Writing Classroom. The International Conference on English Language Teaching (INACELT). *Proceeding.* (Vol. 2, No. 1, Pp. 65-70).
- Sulistyo, T., Eltris, K. P. N., Mafulah, S., Budianto, S., Saiful, S., & Heriyawati, D. F. (2020). Portfolio Assessment: Learning Outcomes and Students' Attitudes. *Studies In English Language and Education*, 7(1), 141-153.
- Sumarno, W. K., & Tatik, M. (2019, June). Using Edmodo-Supported E-Portfolio as Authentic Assessment in EFL Writing Course. In UNNES International Conference on English Language Teaching, Literature, And Translation (ELTLT 2018) (Pp. 102-105). *Atlantis Press*.
- Syafei, M. (2012). Backwash Effects of Portfolio Assessment In Academic Writing Classes 1. *Teflin Journal*, 23(2), 206-221.
- Syafei, M., Mujiyanto, J., Yuliasri, I., & Pratama, H. (2021). Students' Perception of The Application of Portfolio Assessment During The COVID-19 Pandemic. *KnE Social Sciences*, 61-70.
- Taufik, M., & Cahyono, B. Y. (2020). Developing EFL Students' Writing Skills Through Self-Assessment Integrated With E-Portfolio. *IJEE* (*Indonesian Journal of English Education*), 6(2), 171-186.

- Tyas, P. A. (2020). Promoting Students' Autonomous Learning Using Portfolio Assessment in EFL Writing Class. *JEES* (*Journal of English Educators Society*), 5(1), 75–81.
- Usadiati, W., & Norahmi, M. (2018). Portfolio as A Student's Assessment Tool: Lesson Learned. The 65th Teflin International Conference. *Proceeding*. (Vol. 65, No. 01).
- Utama, T. P. (2020). Portfolio System In Teaching Writing: EFL Students' Perceptions. *Pedagogy: Journal of English Language Teaching*, 8(2), 159–168.
- Vasconcelos, S. C., Frazão, I. D. S., Monteiro, E. M. L. M., Lima, M. D. D. C., Albuquerque, J. F. D., & Ramos, V. P. (2013). Nursing Interventions for Drug Users: Qualitative Meta-Synthesis.
- Virgin, J. A., & Bharati, D. A. L. (2020). Teachers' Perception, Plan, And Implementation of Portfolio Assessment in Students' Writing Assessment. *English Education Journal*, 10(2), 143–153.
- Vonti, L. H. (2016). The Relationship Between Learning Motivation, Portfolio Based Assessment, and Students' Writing Ability. *Pedagogia: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan*, 8(2), 424-429.
- Wahono, R. S. (2015). A Systematic Literature Review of Software Defect Prediction. *Journal Of Software Engineering*, *1*(1), 1-16.
- Walvoord, B. E. (2010). Assessment clear and simple: A practical guide for institutions, departments, and general education. John Wiley & Sons.
- Weigle, S. C. (2007). Teaching Writing Teachers About Assessment. *Journal Of Second Language Writing*, 16(3), 194-209
- Xiao, Y., & Watson, M. (2019). Guidance On Conducting a Systematic Literature Review. *Journal Of Planning Education and Research*, 39(1), 93–112.
- Yang, N. D. (2003). Integrating Portfolios into Learning Strategy-Based Instruction for EFL College Students. *IRAL*, 41(4), 293–317.